

RAISING THE VOICES IN THE MASAAJID

By: Moulana Sarfaraaz Khan

No Muslim is unaware of the respect and honour, which the Shariah has prescribed regarding the etiquettes of the Masaajid. It is proven in the Shariah that it is permissible to raise the voice in the Masjid for Azaan, Iqaamat, lectures, advices, loud Salaats (and also those Zikrs which are proven from the Shariah). Only that person who has no affiliation to the Shariah will deny this. The raising of the voices in the Masaajid, for any other reason, other than those which are proven from the Shariah, is contrary to the principles of Deen, hence impermissible.

Hadhrat Saa'ib bin Yazid ؓ says that once he was sitting in Masjid-e-Nabawi ؐ when someone threw a few pebbles in his direction. When he looked up he saw that it was Hadhrat Umar ؓ, who told him to summon certain two persons to appear before him. When the two were brought in his presence, they were asked to which tribe and family they belonged. (The narrator doubts, and says that they were probably asked from where they came). They said that they were inhabitants of Taa'if. Hadhrat Umar ؓ told them that if they were from Madinah Tayyibah, then he would have punished them, because:

“You raised your voices in the Masjid of Nabi ؐ.” [Bukhari Shareef, page 67, vol.1]

Undoubtedly, the raising of the voices in Masjid-e-Nabawi ؐ is forbidden. Nabi ؐ is resting in his grave, and he ؐ hears the Salaat and Salaam which is rendered upon him at his grave-side. Hence the Aayat : ***“Do not raise your voices above that of the Nabi ...”*** will also apply to his Masjid, because it causes a disturbance to Rasoolullaah ؐ. Therefore, it is apparent that to raise the voices in Masjid-e-Nabawi ؐ is strictly forbidden. However, in the above narration, Hadhrat Umar ؓ has stated “Masjid” as the contributory factor for his prohibition of raising the voice. The Ahle-Ilm (Learned Scholars) are not oblivious of this fact that one ruling can be based upon numerous contributory

factors.

Hadhrat Nu`maan bin Basheer τ states that he was once sitting close to the Mimbar of Nabi ρ , when a person commented: *"I do not worry if I do not do any other work, after my acceptance of Islaam, other than giving water to the Haajis."*

Another person said: *"I do not worry, if I do no other work, other than contributing to the construction and service of Masjid-e-Haraam."*

A third person said: *"Jihaad in the path of Allaah Ta`ala far supercedes, that which you have mentioned."*

Hadhrat Umar τ , who was also nearby, said:

"Do not raise your voices at the Mimbar of Rasulullaah ρ ." [Muslim, page 134, vol.2]

Hadhrat Imaam Nawawi (rahmatullahi alaihi) commented, the following on this narration:

"This narration proves that it is Makrooh to raise the voices in the Masaajid, on the day of Jum`ua and other days. This is also proven that when people have gathered for Salaat, then at such a time it is reprehensible to raise the voice even for beneficial (Ilmi) speech, because this will disturb those who are performing Salaat and Zikr. And Allaah Ta`ala Alone knows best." [Muslim, page 134, vol.2]

This much is proven from the commentary of Imaam Nawawi (rahmatullahi alaihi) that to raise the voices, be it for the reason of beneficial talk or Zikr, in any Masjid is forbidden. He attaches the following condition of *"...when people have gathered for Salaat..."* He further explains that this raising of the voices in such situations will cause a disturbance to those performing Salaat.

It is for this reason that those who carry out their Zikrs and daily prescribed recitations, inevitably show little consideration (to others), hence this practice **in the Masaajid** is strictly forbidden. The explanation to the following objection will, Insha-Allaah Ta`ala, be given later: *"Since loud Zikr causes a disturbance to the Musallees, why are lessons (and lectures) given at such times?"*

Hadhrat Abu Huraira ؓ and Hadhrat Ali ؓ narrate a Hadith wherein Nabi ﷺ mentioned 15 signs of Qiyaamah, and he ﷺ said that they (these signs) will surely transpire. One of these signs are:

“Voices will be raised in the Masaajid.” [Mishkaat Shareef, page 470, vol.2 - from Tirmidhi, page 44, vol.2]

Regarding this Hadith, Mullah Ali Qaari Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 1014A.H. - gave the following commentary:

“Some of our Ulama have clearly stated that to raise the voice in the Masjid is HARAAM, even if it is for Zikr.” [Mirqaat, page 171, vo.1 - Multaan print]

From this it is clear that some of the Hanafi Ulama have ruled the raising of the voices in the Masaajid, even for Zikr, as being Haraam.

Allaamah Ala`ud Deen Muhammed bin Ali Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) (passed away 1088 A.H.), writes the following under the Aadaab (etiquettes) of the Masjid:

“To ask (for something) in the Masjid is HARAAM, and to give (something) is Makrooh. Similarly, to look for a lost item in the Masjid (is Makrooh). To recite poems in the Masjid is also Makrooh, unless they are for advice. Similarly, to recite loud Zikr in the Masjid is HARAAM, except for those who are seeking Ilm or Fiqh (i.e. for students of Deen, if they are learning in the Masjid).” [Durrul Mukhtar with the Sharah Raddul Mukhtar, page 617, vol.1, Misr print]

This text also proves that it is Makrooh to raise the voices in the Masaajid, even for Zikr. Allaamah Halbi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) writes in “Ghuniatul Mustamil”, under “Ahkaamul Masjid”:

“It is Waajib to save the Masjid from foul odours ... (similarly it is also necessary to save the Masjid from) the raising of voices and arguments.”

Thereafter, he quotes the following Hadith on the authority of Musannif Abdur Razzaaq:

Hadhrat Ma`az bin Jabal ؓ reported that Nabi ﷺ said: ***“Keep your children and your insane persons away from the Masaajid, also (keep) your buying,***

selling, quarrels and RAISED VOICES (away from the Masaajid)." [Al-Kabeeri, page 566-7 - Musannif Abdur Razzaaq, page 442, vol.1 - Beirut print]

This Hadith also proves that Rasulullaah ﷺ prohibited the raising of the voices in the Masaajid. Here is meant that speech which is unnecessary and without reason.

Allaamah Sayyid Mahmood Aaloosi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) -passed away 1270 A.H. mentioned the following regarding loud Zikr:

*"You see many persons, in your era, who yell when they make du`aa, especially in gatherings (in the Masaajid), to such an extent that they make them (du`as) poetic. They holler to such an extent that ears even get clogged. They are (blissfully) unaware that they have perpetrated two (2) Bid`as. **One is to raise the voice in du`aa, and the other is to raise the voice in the Masjid.**"* [Roohul Ma`aani, page 139, vol.8]

This statement of Allaamah Aaloosi (rahmatullahi alaihi) was made about 150 years ago. We assume that during that era there were no loudspeakers; if he had to be present today to see our present situations, Allah Ta`ala knows best what would have been his reaction !

Haafiz Ibn Taymia Hanbali (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 728 A.H. - writes:

"It is forbidden to raise the voice in the Masjid; it is especially worse to do so in Masjid-e-Nabawi ﷺ." [Manaasikul Hajj, page 36 - Misr print]

Generally, Zikr is made loudly in the Masaajid for name and fame, and to bolster one's own faction (sect), and to degrade persons of other beliefs.

Imaam Ebrahim bin Moosa Shaatbi Maaliki (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 790 A.H. - said in complaint of the same:

"However, to raise the voices in the Masaajid, which is done to highlight altercations in Deen, is a Bid`a..." [Al-I'tisaam, page 79, vol.2 - Misr print]

According to this reference from Imaam Shaatbi (rahmatullahi alaihi) it refers specifically to those who have adopted this form of making Zikr and du`aa in a

screaming mode, not out of attachment to Allaah Ta`ala, but purely out of causing friction and fighting (with other factions). May Allaah Ta`ala out of His Special Mercy and Grace save all Muslims, who have sincere faith, from all types of Bid`ahs, and may He give others the Tawfeeq (Guidance) to tread the "Siraatul Mustaqeem". Ameen.

Imaam Haafizud Deen Muhammed bin Muhammed Bazazi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 827 A.H. - writes:

*"It is stated in Fataawa Qadhi Khaan, that to **raise the voice in Zikr in the Masjid is HARAAM**. The following incident is **authentically** reported from Hadhrat Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood ؓ, that he heard some people who were gathered in the Masjid reciting Laa Ilaaha Illallahu and Durood Shareef loudly. Hadhrat Abdullaah Ibn Mas`ood ؓ went to them and said: 'We did not witness such an act during the time of Nabi ﷺ, and I regard you as **Bid`atees**'. He repeated this again and again until he ejected them from the Masjid."* [Fataawa Bazazia, page 375, vol.3]

From this we learn that to raise the voice in the Masjid in Zikr or Durood Shareef is **BID`A** according to Hadhrat Ibn Mas`ood ؓ. He ejected a group who were reciting Zikr and Durood loudly in the Masjid and he labelled them Bid`atees. Regarding the high status and rank enjoyed by Hadhrat Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood ؓ over the other Sahabah in so far as Tafseer, Fiqh and knowledge is concerned, is as clear as daylight. Nabi ﷺ once said: **"That thing which Ibn Mas`ood prefers for you, I too prefer the same for you and I am pleased with it."** [Mustadrak, page 319, vol.3]

It appears in another narration that Nabi ﷺ said: **"That thing which Ibn Mas`ood prefers for my Ummat, I am pleased with it."** (Mustadrak, page 317, vol.3)

Nabi ﷺ also said: **"That thing which Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood does not approve of, I too disapprove of that thing for you."** [Al-Isti`aab, page 359, vol.1]

It is evidently clear how much Nabi ﷺ had placed his trust and confidence in Hadhrat Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood ؓ.

Hadhrat Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood ؓ gives the following golden advices, which is recorded in Mishkaat Shareef:

“Hadhrat Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood ؓ said: “If any of you wish to follow in the footsteps of someone, then you should follow in the footsteps of those pious persons who had already passed away, because there is no guarantee that a living person will not fall into Fitnah. Those persons (who you should follow) are the companions of Nabi ﷺ. They are the best of this Ummat. Their hearts were pure and they were very deep in knowledge. They were extremely forthright. Allah Ta`ala had specially chosen them for the companionship of His Nabi. They were appointed for the establishment of this Deen. You should recognise their virtue and follow in their footsteps. Hold on firmly, upon whatever you have the ability to follow, from their character and habits, because surely they were guided aright. Narrated by Razeen” [Mishkaat, page 32, vol.1]

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) stated in the commentary of this Hadith that ***the Sahabah (radhiAllaahu anhum) never recited Zikr and Durood Shareef, in loud voices. They also never gathered for this purpose in the Masjid or in their homes.*** [Mirqaat, page 214, vol.1]

An renowned Aalim of the Barelwis, Molvi Abdus Samee` Saheb has also conceded to the above mentioned narration. He states:

“It is reported in “Hamawi”, “It appears in “Fataawa Qadhi” that loud Zikr is Haraam. It is reliably reported from Ibn Mas`ood ؓ that he heard group of people who were gathered in the Masjid, reading “Laa Ilaaha Illallahu” and Durood loudly. He went to them and said: “We have not witnessed this in the era of Rasulullaah ﷺ. I do not perceive you except as Bid`atees.” He continued saying this until he expelled them from the Masjid.”

It can be seen from this narration that Hadhrat Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood ؓ did not (only) object to their new form (of Zikr), in fact he expelled them from the Masjid, due to the fact that to make loud Zikr is contrary to the Sunnat of Rasulullaah ﷺ.” We are saying the same thing that to innovate something contrary to the order of the Shariah is forbidden.” [“Anwaar Saati`a, pages 38/39].

This is the ruling of a Barelwi Aalim, now take note of the ruling of two

prominent Deobandis:

Moulana Sayyid Muhammed Anwar Shah Kashmeeri (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 1352 A.H. avers that **to raise the voice in Zikr in the Masjid is HARAAM**. He states this, by quoting Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi). [Urfush Shazi, page 120]

Moulana Muhammed Yusuf Binori (rahmatullahi alaihi) also clearly mentions the prohibition of raising the voice in Zikr in the Masjid. [Ma'arifus Sunan, page 304, vol.2]

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi) states:

*"Imaam Abu Hanifah's (rahmatullahi alaihi) Mazhab (school of thought) was that it is **MAKROOH** to raise the voice in the Masjid, even if it is for Zikr. Yes, he has given permission for conducting Deeni lessons in the Masjid, if it does not disturb the Musallees, or if no Salaat is taking place in that Masjid (at that time)."* [Mirqaat, page 223, vol.2 - Imdadia Multaan print]

WHAT IS MEANT BY THE WORD "MAKROOH" AS IT APPEARS IN A KITAAB

Hadhrat Imaam Abu Yusuf (rahmatullahi alaihi) asked Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi):

"When you say that you understand something to be "Makrooh", what do you mean thereby?" Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi) replied: **"AT-TAHREEM - (i.e. When I says "Makrooh" I mean HARAAM).**" [Hidaya, page 172, vol.4]

The author of "Hidaya" states that it has been firmly established from Imaam Muhammed (rahmatullahi alaihi) that **he regards "Makrooh" to mean HARAAM**.

Imaams Abu Hanifah and Abu Yusuf (rahmatullahi alaihim) said:

"It (Makrooh) is the closest to Haraam." [Hidaya, page 185, vol.4]

Hadhrat Mujaddid Alf-e-Thaani (rahmatullahi alaihi) states:

"That Makrooh which comes in opposition to Mubaah (permissible), it denotes MAKROOH-E-TAHRIMI." [Maktoob, page 29, Daftar Awwal, first

part, page 79 - Lahore print]

Those Hanafi Ulama (rahmatullahi alaihim) who have ruled the raising of the voices in the Masaajid as Haraam, have based their rulings on the view of Imaam Abu Hanifa (rahmatullahi alaihi), and those who have ruled it as being Makrooh, refer to Makrooh-e-Tahrimi.

It has now become very evidently clear, that according to Imaam Abu Hanifa (rahmatullahi alaihi), it is a separate Bid'a to make Zikr loudly, and another Bid'a to make it loudly in the Masjid.

The Masaajid are such places where one gains the recognition of Allaah Ta'ala and one attains the Sunnat of Rasulullaah ﷺ. Its respect and honour is binding upon each and every Muslim. The Aayat of Allaah Ta'ala (in Surah Noor):

"In the "Buyoot" (Masaajid), Allaah Ta'ala has ordered that they be raised (honoured/ respected)"

bears testimony to this fact. It is a basic requisite for the protection of this Deen, that the Masaajid are protected internally as well as externally.

However, sad to say, we note that nowadays the Masaajid are merely specimens of show, pomp and glory.

Hadhrat Abu Huraira ؓ reports that Rasulullaah ﷺ said:

"When the Salaat has begun, do not approach it running, come walking (at normal pace). It is necessary that you adopt calmness and tranquillity. Perform those Rakaats which you have attained, and complete those which you have missed." [Abu Dawood, page 84, vo.1].

One of the reasons for the prohibition of running in the Masjid, is that this act is disrespectful to the sanctity of the Masjid, and is therefore undesirable.

Hadhrat Ibn Mas'ood ؓ reports that Nabi ﷺ said:

"The intelligent and mature ones amongst you should stand closest to me, then those after them and then those after them. Save yourselves (in the Masjid) from the noise and bustle of the market places." [Mishkaat, page 98, vol.1].

This narration proves that the Masaajid must be saved from the noise, hustle and bustle of the market places, especially during the times of Jamaat Salaat.

Nabi ρ has expressly prohibited this. One should understand from this Hadith that to raise the voices in noise at the market places is commendable or acceptable. Some people regard it as being permissible, and worthy of Thawaab, but Islaam has also placed restrictions here. Islaam does not condone any sort of noise and disturbance.

In Bukhari Shareef, where the qualities of Nabi ρ are extolled as they appear in the Tawraah, the following is also recorded:

“And Nabi ρ does not make noise in the market places.” [pages 285 and 717, vol.2].

Hadhrat Imaam Bukhari (rahmatullahi alaihi) has recorded this narration in the first instance, under the chapter entitled: **“Chapter on the prohibition of making a noise in the market places”**.

It is evident that Allaah Ta`ala has sent Nabi ρ as a perfect example for mankind and as a role model, hence it is imperative that the Ummat follow this example.

Hadhrat Abu Huraira (radhiAllaahu anhu reports that Nabi ρ said:

“Allaah Ta`ala holds every such person in contempt, who has pride, hoards wealth (and is miserly), makes a noise in the market places, lazes like a dead person at night (does not perform Tahajjud Salaat), and works like a donkey during the day. He is well aware of the worldly matters, and oblivious of matters pertaining to the hereafter.” [Mawaariduz Zam`aan, page 485].

Some people are expert at worldly matters, but they are completely oblivious and in the dark regarding Deeni and Ukhrawi (hereafter) matters. May Allaah Ta`ala save us from becoming such persons. It is indeed sad to note that these days people have become extremely negligent regarding the sanctity and honour of the Masaajid. Those prophecies of our beloved Rasulullaah ρ - mentioned hereunder - have become as glaring as daylight in our present age. They are all being enacted to the letter:

Hadhrat Abdullaah ibn Mas`ood τ reports that Nabi ρ said:

“There will come a time, during the final days, that people will speak such

things in the Masaajid, which Allaah Ta`ala will have no need for.
[Mawaariduz Zam`aan, page 99].

The speech referred to in this narration will not have anything to do with Deen, because any such speech, which complies to and has relevance to the Deen, is supposed to be spread from the Masaajid. The Masaajid are the platforms for spreading Deeni matters. This speech (referred to in the narration) is regarding worldly matters. Such things are not lacking in our Masaajid these days.

Imaam Nasar bin Muhammed bin Ebrahim Samarqandi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaih) - passed away 393 A.H. reports the following:

“Indeed Nabi ρ has said: ‘Such a time will befall my Ummat when their speech in the Masaajid will be regarding their worldly matters. Allaah Ta`ala will have no need for such speech, hence you should not sit amongst them.’ [Tanbeehul Ghaafileen, page 112 Misr print].

Hadhrat Anas τ reports that Nabi ρ said:

“Such a time will dawn upon my Ummat when they will gather (form groups) in the Masaajid, and they will have worldly motives. Allaah Ta`ala has no need for them, hence do not sit with them.” [Mustadrak, page 323, vol.4].

The gathering in the Masaajid for Ta`leem (learning and teaching) purely with worldly motives (earning wealth), Khatam Shareef, Ghiyaarwi, etc., are all included in the above narrations.

Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ reports:

“Such a time will befall this Ummat when they will gather in the Masaajid, and they will perform Salaat, but there will not be a single Mu`min amongst them.” [Mustadrak, page 442, vol.4].

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaih) reports:

“Imaam Ibn Humaam has clarified that even permissible speech is forbidden in the Masaajid. Such speech devours good deeds. So what about such speech during Tawaaf, when Tawaaf is in the order of Salaat?”

[Al-Maslakul Muttaqist, page 110]

Just as Salaat is an act of worship, so too is Tawaaf of the Kaaba, however, necessary speech during Tawaaf is permissible. As it has been reported in a Hadith that Tawaaf is just like Salaat, but speech is allowed therein. [Al-Maslakul Muttaqist, page 111, Misr print].

Allaamah Hussein bin Muhammed Saeed Abdul Ghani Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi), states in commentary of the above:

“It is stated in “Zahriyya” that to gather in the Masaajid with worldly motives is not permissible, because the Masaajid have not been built for worldly reasons. It is stated in “Jalaabi”, under the chapter of Salaat that some permissible worldly talk is allowed in the Masaajid, but it is better for one to engage in some form of Zikr (remembrance of Allaah Ta`ala). The same is reported in “Tamartaashi Hindiya”.

From this we gather that to sit in the Masjid expressly for worldly motives is forbidden. Yes, if one went to the Masjid for the reason of listening to a lecture or for Ta`leem etc, and one had engaged in some worldly talk ‘by the way’, then from the text of Tamartaashi - [Imaam Shamsud Deen Muhammed bin Abdullaah bin Ahmed Tamartaashi Hanafi (rahmatullahi alaihi) passed away 1004 A.H.], there is leeway in accepting such an indulgence. However, this much must also be remembered that this speech must be restricted to necessity. If one spoke without necessity and merely to engage in “small talk”, then this is also forbidden.

Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi) mentions the following under the Makroohaats of Tawaaf:

“Wasteful / Unnecessary speech (is also Makrooh), except that (speech) which is necessary, then it will be allowed to the extent of its necessity.” [Al-Maslakul Mitaqist, page 112, Misr print].

It is mentioned in “Irshaadus Saari”:

“Sheikh Abdullaah Afeef (rahmatullahi alaihi) has recorded that necessary speech (during Tawaaf) will be acceptable, if the occasion warrants.” [page 110].

The above is stated fully in Fataawa Hindiya:

“To gather in the Masaajid for (vain) talk is undoubtedly forbidden, because the Masaajid are not built for worldly purposes. The subject matter which appears in “Khazaanatul Fiqh” also proves that permissible worldly talk in the Masaajid is Haraam. He has said that one should not speak worldly matters in the Masaajid. It is stated in “Jalaabi” that permissible worldly talk in the Masaajid is allowed, but it is better to engage oneself in some form of Zikr. The same is reported in “Tamartaashi”.” [Aalimgiri, page 356, Misr print].

One should keep in mind that even those Ulama who have given consent for worldly speech in the Masaajid, have expressly stated that this is only permissible, in time of necessity.

Amongst those Ulama who had more free thinking and views, like Allaamah Ibn Hazam Zaahiri (rahmatullahi alaihi) - passed away 456 A.H. - was also constrained to say the following regarding the matter at hand:

“That worldly speech which has no sin in it, is permissible in the Masaajid, although it is more commendable that one engages in Zikr of Allaah Ta`ala.” [Muhalla Ibn Hazam, page 241, vol.4].

It is obvious that such sinful talk, like backbiting, making fun of others, hurting the feelings of others, etc.; just as it is forbidden outside the Masjid, all the more it is Haraam inside the Masjid. Yes, such talk which is not sinful, is allowed inside the Masjid, **at times of necessity and limited**, however it is **better to engage in remembrance of Allaah Ta`ala**.

It is permissible to raise the voice in the Masjid for Ta`leem (teaching).

It is stated in Mirqaat that Hadhrat Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi) has given consent to conducting Deeni talk and advices in the Masaajid, **on condition** that it does **not disturb those who are engaged in Salaat**.

It is averred from some quarters that, since loud Zikr is not allowed in the Masaajid, then all lectures etc. also be terminated. But, they say, this will not be done because it would constitute a blow to the Rozi (earnings) of the lecturers.

ANSWER:

The Ulama of the Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat, do not give lectures and lessons in loud voices in the Masaajid, for the reason of earning a living. Allaah Ta`ala has provided numerous avenues for one to earn a living. They raise their voices when giving lectures and advices, because Nabi ﷺ used to give Khutbahs (lectures / advices) in a loud voice in the Masjid. They raise their voices when giving lectures and advices, because Imaam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullahi alaihi) has consented to it and those adhering to the Hanafi Mazhab, should follow their Imaam. We follow and accept the view of Imaam Saheb (rahmatullahi alaihi) regarding all other rulings and beliefs. Those who raise objections are free to follow whomsoever they desire.

Hadhrat Abu Huraira ؓ reported that Rasulullaah ﷺ said that the person who comes to the Masjid, purely for the reason of learning or teaching Ilm, will be like one who strives in Jihaad in the path of Allaah Ta`ala. [Ibn Majah, page 20].

Hadhrat Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi) states in commentary of this Hadith:

“The word “or” which appears in the Hadith (“...learning or teaching...”) is not because of doubt, rather it denotes diversity. This is clear proof that teaching in the Masjid is permissible. Contrary to that which was previously reported from Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaihi), that the voice cannot be raised in the Masaajid even for Ilmi talk. He has probably forbidden such talk, if it causes a disturbance to others. This person (who teaches or learns in the Masjid), is similar in rank to one who strives in Jihaad, because both these (seeking knowledge and Jihaad) are Fardh-e-Kifaayah.” [Mirqaat, page 221, vol.2]

From this we gather that to wage Jihaad in normal circumstances is Fardh-e-Kifaayah (when the Muslims are besieged by the Kuffaar, then Jihaad becomes Fardh-e-Ain). Similarly, to seek that (Shar`i) knowledge which is over and above the necessity is Fardh-e-Kifaayah (to seek that much (Shar`i) knowledge regarding one's everyday life is Fardh-e-Ain). Hence, both these persons (Mujaahid and Islamic student/teacher) are regarded as being in the path of Allaah Ta`ala. Some Ulama have written and Imaam Nawawi

(rahmatullahi alaihi) has also stated that Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaihi) and other Ulama have stated that to raise the voice in the Masaajid, even for learning and teaching is Makrooh. However, Imaam Abu Hanifa and Imaam Muhammed bin Maslimah Maaliki (rahmatullahi alaihimah) have given consent to the raising of the voices in the Masaajid to the reasons of learning, teaching and Ilmi discussions, because people gather in the Masaajid for this reason. [Muhsala Sharah Muslim, page 210, vol.1].

Mullah Ali Qaari (rahmatullahi alaihi) has also recorded in numerous places this view of Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaihi). In Mirqaat, page 223, vol.2, he states that this ruling of Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaihi) is not general, but refers to those instances where it causes a disturbance to others. This interpretation appears to be the most correct, because Nabi ﷺ used to give advices in a loud voice, and it has also been reported that he ﷺ used to ask the Sahabah (radhiAllahu anhum) after every Fajr Salaat regarding any dream that they saw. Thereafter, Nabi ﷺ would interpret such dreams.

One such incident, wherein Nabi ﷺ relates his own dream appears in a lengthy Hadith in Bukhari Shareef (pages 185 and 1043). It is clear that such episodes could not have taken place except with the raising of the voices. It is obvious that such incidents were not hidden from the likes of Imaam Maalik (rahmatullahi alaihi).

AND ALLAAH TA'ALA ALONE KNOWS BEST.

A H ELIAS (MUFTI)
1242/ 2004